The Avosetta Series publishes texts that present innovative discourse on European Environmental Law.

About the book
This book examines how the weighing up of property and environmental protection interests is determined by law in the EU and their Member States.

Also published in The Avosetta Series:
2) *Competition Law and Environmental Protection in Europe: Towards Sustainability?*, Dr. Hans Vedder (ISBN 9789076871943)
3) *Integration of Environmental Protection into other EC Policies: Legal Theory and Practice*, Dr. Nele Dhof (ISBN 9789089532042)
8) *Sustainable Development in International and National Law*, edited by Prof. H.C. Bugge & Dr. C. Voigt (ISBN 9789097687184)
Europa Law Publishing is a publishing company specializing in European Union law, international trade law, public international law, environmental law and comparative national law. 

For further information please contact Europa Law Publishing via email: info@europalawpublishing.com or visit our website at: www.europalawpublishing.com.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted, in any form or by any means, or stored in any retrieval system of any nature, without the written permission of the publisher.

Application for permission for use of copyright material shall be made to the publishers. Full acknowledgement of author, publisher and source must be given.

Voor zover het maken van kopieën uit deze uitgave is toegestaan op grond van artikel 16h t/m 16m Auteurswet 1912 juncto het Besluit van 27 november 2002, Stb. 575, dient men de daarvoor wettelijk verschuldigde vergoedingen te voldoen aan de Stichting Reprorecht (Postbus 3060, 2130 KB Hoofddorp).

Voor het overnemen van (een) gedeelte(n) uit deze uitgave in bloemlezingen, readers en andere compilatiewerken (artikel 16 Auteurswet 1912) dient men zich tot de uitgever te wenden.

© Europa Law Publishing, the authors severally, 2015

Typeset in Scala and Scala Sans, Graphic design by G2K Designers, Groningen/Amsterdam

NUR 828


The Avosetta Series publishes texts that present innovative discourse on European Environmental Law.
# Part I Property and Environmental Protection

An Overview

Gerd Winter

1. General Reflections on Private Property  
   1.1 Reasons for a Property Guarantee  
   1.2 Institutions Determining Property Concepts  
   1.3 Multilevel Property Protection  
   1.4 Comparing Property Protection  
2. Private Property, Public Property, Common Good  
3. Private Property in Private and Public Law  
4. Constitutionalising Private Property  
5. The Objects of Property  
6. Property as Opponent and as Defender of Environmental Protection  
7. The Scope of Private Property in Relation to Environmental Protection  
8. Self-Binding Obligations as Property Content  
9. Regulation of Property Uses  
10. The Taking of Property  
   10.1 Characterization of Taking  
   10.2 Preconditions and Effects of Lawful Taking  
11. Onerous Restrictions of Property Uses (Indirect Expropriation, Conditioned Content Determination)  
   11.1 Categorizing Use Restrictions  
   11.2 Characterization  
   11.2.1 Gravity of Impact  
   11.2.2 Sacrifice for the Public Benefit  
   11.2.3 Weighing up the Gravity of Impact and the Public Interest  
   11.3 Preconditions and Effects  
12. Dissolution of Property Positions Through Fundamental Policy Change

# Part II Jurisprudence of the European Court of Human Rights, Court of Justice of the European Union, and Courts of Transnational Arbitration

**Chapter 1**  
Property and Environmental Protection in the Jurisprudence of the European Court of Human Rights  
Bernhard Wegener
CHAPTER 2

Property and Environmental Protection in the Jurisprudence of the Court of Justice of the European Union
Jan H. Jans & Annalies Outhuijse

A. Introduction 42
B. The Legal Status of the Right to Property in EU Law 42
C. Who is Responsible For What? 45
D. Balancing the Right to Property and Environmental Protection Requirements in the Case Law of the CJEU 50
   1. The Right to Property as ‘Shield’ to Environmental Regulation 50
   2. The Right to Property as a ‘Sword’ 52
E. Restricting the Right to Property With or Without Compensation? 52
F. Conclusion 54

CHAPTER 3

The ECJ Jurisprudence on Nature Protection and Ownership Rights
Agustin Garcia-Ureta

A. Introduction 56
B. Natura 2000 and Ownership Rights 57
   1. Introductory Remarks 57
   2. The Role of ‘Economic’ Requirements in the WBD and HD 59
   3. Restrictions on the Carrying out of Activities in ECJ Case Law 61
   4. Compensation Measures and Property Rights in Environmental Assessments under the Habitats Directive 65
   5. Declassification of Sites and Ownership Rights 66
   6. Habitats, Species and Ownership Rights 68
C. Concluding Remarks 73
CHAPTER 4  Property and Environmental Protection in Investor – State Arbitration
Ole Kristian Fauchald

A. Introduction 76
B. Definition of Investment 77
C. Whose Rights are Protected? 82
D. Indirect Expropriation 82
E. Amount of Compensation 87
F. Concluding Remarks 90

Part II EU and EEA Member States

CHAPTER 1  Property and Environmental Protection in Belgium
Luc Lavrysen

A./B. Objects of Private Property, Private Property in Natural Resources 94
C. Private Property Used in Defense of Environmental Protection 94
D. Property in Public Aids for Beneficial Use of Natural Resources 96
E. Expropriation 97
F. Indirect Expropriation by Environmental Regulation? 101
G. Dissolution of Property for Environmental Protection 103
H. State Liability for Environmental Damage to Private Property 105
I. Proprietor’s Liability for Environmental Damage 106
J. Permit Excuse in Environmental Liability 107
K. Direct or Indirect Expropriation by EU Measures 108

CHAPTER 2  Property and Environmental Protection in Czechia
Ilona Jancarova, Jakub Hanak & Vojtech Vomacka

A. Objects of Private Property 112
B. Private Property in Natural Resources 115
C. Private Property Used in Defense of Environmental Protection 118
D. Natural Resources as Public Property or Interest 119
E. Property in Public Aids for Beneficial Use of Natural Resources 120
F. Expropriation 121
G. Indirect Expropriation by Environmental Regulation? 122
H. Dissolution of Property for Environmental Protection 124
I. State Liability for Environmental Damage to Private Property 125
CHAPTER 3

Property and Environmental Protection in Croatia
Lana Ofak

A. Objects of Private Property
B. Private Property in Natural Resources
C. Private Property Used in Defense of Environmental Protection
D. Natural Resources as Public Property or Interest
E. Property in Public Aids for Beneficial Use of Natural Resources
F. Expropriation
G. Indirect Expropriation by Environmental Regulation?
H. Dissolution of Property for Environmental Protection
I. State Liability for Environmental Damage to Private Property
J. Proprietor’s Liability for Environmental Damage
K. Permit Excuse in Environmental Liability
L. Direct or Indirect Expropriation by EU Measures

CHAPTER 4

Property and Environmental Protection in Denmark
Peter Pagh

A. Constitutional Aspects
B. The Scope of Private Property Protection
C. Natural Resources as Legal Concept
D. The Legal Status of Subsidies For Environmental Friendly Use
E. Landowner Liability, State Liability and Operator Liability

CHAPTER 5

Property and Environmental Protection in France
Matthieu Galey

A. Objects of Private Property
B. Private Property in Natural Resources
C. Private Property Used in Defense of Environmental Protection
D. Natural Resources as Public Property or Interest
E. Property in Public Aids for Beneficial Use of Natural Resources
F. Expropriation
G. Indirect Expropriation by Environmental Regulation?
CONTENTS

H. Dissolution of Property for Environmental Protection 165
I. State Liability for Environmental Damage to Private Property (incl. Case of Communal Waste Disposal Site) 166
J. Proprietor’s Liability for Environmental Damage 167
K. Permit Excuse in Environmental Liability 168
L. Direct or Indirect Expropriation by EU Measures 169

CHAPTER 6
Property and Environmental Protection in Germany
Gerd Winter

A. Objects of Private Property 172
B. Private Property in Natural Resources 173
C. Private Property Used in Defense of Environmental Protection (incl. Case of Polluting Factory) 173
D. Natural Resources as Public Property or Interest 176
E. Property in Public Aids for Beneficial Use of Natural Resources 177
F. Expropriation 177
G. Indirect Expropriation by Environmental Regulation? 179
H. Dissolution of Property for Environmental Protection 181
I. State Liability for Environmental Damage to Private Property (incl. Case of Municipal Waste Disposal Site) 182
J. Proprietor’s Liability for Environmental Damage 184
K. Permit Excuse in Environmental Liability 184
L. Direct or Indirect Expropriation by EU Measures 184

CHAPTER 7
Property and Environmental Protection in Hungary
Gyula Bándi

Introduction: the Concept of Environmental and Property Rights 186
A. Objects of Private Property 187
B. Private Property in Natural Resources 188
C. Private Property as Opponent and Defense of Environmental Protection 188
D. Natural Resources as Public Property or Interest 190
E. Property in Public Aids for Beneficial Use of Natural Resources 191
F. Expropriation 192
G. Indirect Expropriation by Environmental Regulation? 193
H. Dissolution of Property for Environmental Protection 194
I. State Liability for Environmental Damage to Private Property 194
J. Proprietor’s Liability for Environmental Damage 196
K. Permit Excuse in Environmental Liability 196
L. Direct or Indirect Expropriation by EU Measures 197
CHAPTER 8  
Property and Environmental Protection in Italy  
Massimiliano Montini  

A. Objects of Private Property  
B. Private Property in Natural Resources  
C. Private Property Used in Defense of Environmental Protection (incl. Case on Industrial Pollution)  
D. Natural Resources as Public Property or Interest  
E. Property in Public Aids for Beneficial Use of Natural Resources  
F. Expropriation  
G. Indirect Expropriation by Environmental Regulation?  
H. Dissolution of Property for Environmental Protection  
I. State Liability for Environmental Damage to Private Property (incl. Case of Municipal Waste Disposal Site)  
J. Proprietor’s Liability for Environmental Damage  
K. Permit Excuse in Environmental Liability  
L. Direct or Indirect Expropriation by EU Measures

CHAPTER 9  
Property and Environmental Protection in Latvia  
Zaneta Mikosa  

A. Objects of Private Property  
B. Private Property in Natural Resources  
C. Private Property Used in Defense of Environmental Protection (incl. Case on Pollution from Industrial Installation)  
D. Natural Resources as Public Property or Interest  
E. Property in Public Aids for Beneficial Use of Natural Resources  
F. Expropriation  
G. Indirect Expropriation by Environmental Regulation?  
H. Dissolution of Property for Environmental Protection  
I. State Liability for Environmental Damage to Private Property  
J. Proprietor’s Liability for Environmental Damage  
K. Permit Excuse in Environmental Liability  
L. Direct or Indirect Expropriation by EU Measures

CHAPTER 10  
Property and Environmental Protection in the Netherlands  
Jan H. Jans & Annalies Outhuijse  

A. Constitutional Framework  
B. Article 1, Protocol 1 ECHR  
C. The Égalité-Principle
## CONTENTS

D. The Two Cases According to Dutch Law 231  
E. Summary 231

### CHAPTER 11

**Property and Environmental Protection in Norway**  
Ole Kristian Fauchald

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>A. Objects of Private Property</th>
<th>234</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>B. Private Property in Natural Resources</td>
<td>235</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Private Property Used in Defense of Environmental Protection</td>
<td>235</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Natural Resources as Public Property or Interest</td>
<td>236</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E. Property in Public Aids for Beneficial Use of Natural Resources</td>
<td>238</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F. Expropriation</td>
<td>238</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G. Indirect Expropriation by Environmental Regulation?</td>
<td>239</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H. Dissolution of Property for Environmental Protection</td>
<td>240</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I. State Liability for Environmental Damage to Private Property</td>
<td>241</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>J. Proprietor’s Liability for Environmental Damage</td>
<td>242</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>K. Permit Excuse in Environmental Liability</td>
<td>242</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L. Direct or Indirect Expropriation by EU Measures</td>
<td>243</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### CHAPTER 12

**Property and Environmental Protection in Poland**  
Barbara Iwanska & Mariusz Baran

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>A. Objects of Private Property; Property in Natural Resources</th>
<th>246</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>C. Private Property in Natural Resources</td>
<td>249</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Natural Resources as Public Property or Interest</td>
<td>253</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E. Property in Public Aids for Beneficial Use of Natural Resources</td>
<td>255</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F. Expropriation</td>
<td>255</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G. Indirect Expropriation by Environmental Regulation?</td>
<td>256</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H. Dissolution of Property for Environmental Protection</td>
<td>258</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>J. Proprietor’s Liability for Environmental Damage</td>
<td>259</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>K. Permit Excuse in Environmental Liability</td>
<td>259</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L. Direct or Indirect Expropriation by EU Measures</td>
<td>259</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### CHAPTER 13

**Property and Environmental Protection in Portugal**  
Alexandra Aragão

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>A. Introduction</th>
<th>262</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>B. The Right to Property and to Environmental Protection in the Constitution</td>
<td>262</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Ownership of Natural Resources</td>
<td>263</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Management of Natural Resources</td>
<td>266</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
E. Expropriation 269
F. Restriction to Private Property 271
G. Environmental Protection Against Private Property 275
H. Environmental Protection Through Private Property 277
I. Conclusion 277

### CHAPTER 14

**Property and Environmental Protection in Slovenia**
Rajko Knez

A. Objects of Private Property 280
B. Private Property in Natural Resources 280
C. Private Property Used in Defense of Environmental Protection 281
D. Natural Resources as Public Property or Interest 283
E. Property in Public Aids for Beneficial Use of Natural Resources 284
F. Expropriation 284
G. Indirect Expropriation by Environmental Regulation? 285
H. Dissolution of Property for Environmental Protection 286
I. State Liability for Environmental Damage to Private Property 287
J. Proprietor’s Liability for Environmental Damage 288
K. Permit Excuse in Environmental Liability 288
L. Direct or Indirect Expropriation by EU Measures 289

### CHAPTER 15

**Property and Environmental Protection in Spain**
Agustin Garcia-Ureta

A. Objects of Private Property 292
B. Private Property in Natural Resources 293
C. Private Property Used in Defense of Environmental Protection 294
D. Natural Resources as Public Property or Interest 295
E. Property in Public Aids for Beneficial Use of Natural Resources 296
F. Expropriation 297
G. Indirect Expropriation by Environmental Regulation? 298
H. Dissolution of Property for Environmental Protection 300
I. State Liability for Environmental Damage to Private Property 302
J. Proprietor’s Liability for Environmental Damage 303
K. Permit Excuse in Environmental Liability 303
L. Direct or Indirect Expropriation by EU Measures 304
## Chapter 16

**Property and Environmental Protection in the United Kingdom**  
Eloise Scotford

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Overall Comments</th>
<th>306</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. Objects of Private Property</td>
<td>306</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Private Property in Natural Resources</td>
<td>307</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Private Property Used in Defence of Environmental Protection</td>
<td>308</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Private Property Used in Defence of Environmental Protection</td>
<td>310</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E. Property in Public Aids for Beneficial Use of Natural Resources</td>
<td>310</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F. Expropriation</td>
<td>311</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G. Indirect Expropriation by Environmental Regulation?</td>
<td>313</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H. Dissolution of Property for Environmental Protection Reasons</td>
<td>315</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I. State Liability for Environmental Damage by Government Action to Private Property</td>
<td>315</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>J. Proprietor’s Liability for Environmental Damage</td>
<td>316</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>K. Permit Excuse in Environmental Liability</td>
<td>317</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L. Direct or Indirect Expropriation by EU Measures</td>
<td>317</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Part III Comparative Studies

#### Chapter 1

**In the Name of “Common Interest”: Framing Environmental Goods as Common Goods**  
Massimiliano Montini & Mery Ciacci

| A. Introduction                  | 322 |
| B. Public Ownership and Private Ownership of Environmental Goods in the European Jurisdictions: an Overview | 324 |
| C. Ownership in Whose Interest?  | 327 |
| D. In the Name of ‘Common Interest’: Environmental Goods as Common Goods | 331 |
| E. Conclusion                    | 335 |

#### Chapter 2

**Private Property in Request for Environmental Protection**  
Rajko Knez

| A. Introduction                  | 340 |
| B. Property Based Remedies Asking for Environmental Protection | 341 |
| I. Private Law Remedies          | 342 |
CHAPTER 3

Private Rights and Public Regulation. Civil Liability and the ‘Permit Defence’
Eloise Scotford

A. No Permit Defence to Third Party Liability of Regulated Entities
B. Permit Defence to Third Party Liability of Regulated Entities
C. Conclusion

Questionnaire

2. Public Law Remedies
C. Conclusion