



Property and Environmental Protection in Europe

Edited by Gerd Winter

Europa Law Publishing

Property and Environmental Protection in Europe

The Avosetta Series publishes texts that present innovative discourse on European Environmental Law.

About the book

This book examines how the weighing up of property and environmental protection interests is determined by law in the EU and their Member States.

Also published in The Avosetta Series:

- 1) *The European Convention and the Future of European Environmental Law*, edited by Prof. Jan H. Jans (ISBN 9789076871134)
- 2) *Competition Law and Environmental Protection in Europe; Towards Sustainability?* Dr. Hans Vedder (ISBN 9789076871943)
- 3) *Integration of Environmental Protection into other EC Policies; Legal Theory and Practice*, Dr. Nele Dhondt (ISBN 9789089520142)
- 4) *Principles of European Environmental Law*, edited by Prof. Richard Macrory (ISBN 9789089520470)
- 5) *Environmental Crime in Europe; Rules of Sanctions*, edited by Françoise Comte & Prof. Dr. Ludwig Krämer (ISBN 9789076871929)
- 6) *Access to Justice in Environmental Matters and the Role of NGOs; Empirical Findings and Legal Appraisal*, edited by Prof. Nicolas de Sadeleer, Prof. Gerhard Roller & Miriam Dross (ISBN 9789076871288)
- 7) *Reflections on 30 Years of EU Environmental Law; A High Level of Protection?* edited by Prof. Richard Macrory (ISBN 9789089521309)
- 8) *Sustainable Development in International and National Law*, edited by Prof. H.C. Bugge & Dr. C. Voigt (ISBN 9789076871844)
- 9) *The Aarhus Convention at Ten. Interactions and Tensions between Conventional International Law and EU Environmental Law*, edited by Prof. M. Pallemmaerts (ISBN 9789089520487)
- 10) *National Courts and EU Environmental Law*, edited by J.H. Jans, R. Macrory, A-M Moreno Molina (ISBN 9789089521286)
- 11) *Environmental Democracy and Law. Public Participation in Europe*, edited by Gyula Bándi (ISBN 9789089521491)

ISBN 9789089521675



9 789089 521675



Europa Law Publishing

Environmental and Property Protection in Europe

Edited by Gerd Winter

The Avosetta Series (12)

Proceedings of the Avosetta Group of European Environmental Lawyers

Europa Law Publishing is a publishing company specializing in European Union law, international trade law, public international law, environmental law and comparative national law.

For further information please contact Europa Law Publishing via email: info@europalawpublishing.com or visit our website at: www.europalawpublishing.com.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted, in any form or by any means, or stored in any retrieval system of any nature, without the written permission of the publisher. Application for permission for use of copyright material shall be made to the publishers. Full acknowledgement of author, publisher and source must be given.

Voor zover het maken van kopieën uit deze uitgave is toegestaan op grond van artikel 16h t/m 16m Auteurswet 1912 *juncto* het Besluit van 27 november 2002, Stb. 575, dient men de daarvoor wettelijk verschuldigde vergoedingen te voldoen aan de Stichting Reprorecht (Postbus 3060, 2130 KB Hoofddorp). Voor het overnemen van (een) gedeelte(n) uit deze uitgave in bloemlezingen, readers en andere compilatiewerken (artikel 16 Auteurswet 1912) dient men zich tot de uitgever te wenden.

© Europa Law Publishing, the authors severally, 2015

Typeset in Scala and Scala Sans, Graphic design by G2K Designers, Groningen/Amsterdam

NUR 828

ISBN 978-90-8952-167-5 (paper)

ISBN 978-90-8952-168-2 (ebook)

The Avosetta Series publishes texts that present innovative discourse on European Environmental Law.

<i>Contents</i>	v
<i>Authors</i>	xvi

Part I	Property and Environmental Protection	
	An Overview	
	Gerd Winter	
I.	General Reflections on Private Property	2
I.1	Reasons for a Property Guarantee	2
I.2	Institutions Determining Property Concepts	3
I.3	Multilevel Property Protection	4
I.4	Comparing Property Protection	5
2.	Private Property, Public Property, Common Good	5
3.	Private Property in Private and Public Law	6
4.	Constitutionalising Private Property	7
5.	The Objects of Property	7
6.	Property as Opponent and as Defender of Environmental Protection	9
7.	The Scope of Private Property in Relation to Environmental Protection	10
8.	Self-Binding Obligations as Property Content	12
9.	Regulation of Property Uses	13
10.	The Taking of Property	15
10.1	Characterization of Taking	15
10.2	Preconditions and Effects of Lawful Taking	16
II.	Onerous Restrictions of Property Uses (Indirect Expropriation, Conditioned Content Determination)	17
II.1	Categorizing Use Restrictions	17
II.2	Characterization	18
II.2.1	Gravity of Impact	19
II.2.2	Sacrifice for the Public Benefit	20
II.2.2	Weighing up the Gravity of Impact and the Public Interest	20
II.2.3	Sectoral Legislation and Case Law	21
II.3	Preconditions and Effects	22
12.	Dissolution of Property Positions Through Fundamental Policy Change	23
Part II	Jurisprudence of the European Court of Human Rights, Court of Justice of the European Union, and Courts of Transnational Arbitration	
CHAPTER I	Property and Environmental Protection in the Jurisprudence of the European Court of Human Rights	
	Bernhard Wegener	

	A.	Historical Development	28
	B.	Importance of Environmental Protection in the Court's Case-Law	28
	C.	Property and the Environment	30
	1.	Depriving or Restricting Property to Protect the Environment	31
	2.	Property Protecting the Environment	36
	D.	The Parallel Jurisdiction Concerning Art. 8 ECHR	38
	E.	Some Preliminary Conclusions	39
CHAPTER 2		Property and Environmental Protection in the Jurisprudence of the Court of Justice of the European Union	
		Jan H. Jans & Annalies Outhuijse	
	A.	Introduction	42
	B.	The Legal Status of the Right to Property in EU Law	42
	C.	Who is Responsible For What?	45
	D.	Balancing the Right to Property and Environmental Protection Requirements in the Case Law of the CJEU	50
	1.	The Right to Property as 'Shield' to Environmental Regulation	50
	2.	The Right to Property as a 'Sword'	52
	E.	Restricting the Right to Property With or Without Compensation?	52
	F.	Conclusion	54
CHAPTER 3		The ECJ Jurisprudence on Nature Protection and Ownership Rights	
		Agustin Garcia- Ureta	
	A.	Introduction	56
	B.	Natura 2000 and Ownership Rights	57
	1.	Introductory Remarks	57
	2.	The Role of 'Economic' Requirements in the WBD and HD	59
	3.	Restrictions on the Carrying out of Activities in ECJ Case Law	61
	4.	Compensation Measures and Property Rights in Environmental Assessments under the Habitats Directive	65
	5.	Declassification of Sites and Ownership Rights	66
	6.	Habitats, Species and Ownership Rights	68
	C.	Concluding Remarks	73

CHAPTER 4 **Property and Environmental Protection in Investor – State Arbitration**

Ole Kristian Fauchald

A.	Introduction	76
B.	Definition of Investment	77
C.	Whose Rights are Protected?	82
D.	Indirect Expropriation	82
E.	Amount of Compensation	87
F.	Concluding Remarks	90

/// Part II EU and EEA Member States

CHAPTER I **Property and Environmental Protection in Belgium**

Luc Lavrysen

A./B.	Objects of Private Property, Private Property in Natural Resources	94
C.	Private Property Used in Defense of Environmental Protection	94
D.	Property in Public Aids for Beneficial Use of Natural Resources	96
E.	Expropriation	97
F.	Indirect Expropriation by Environmental Regulation?	101
G.	Dissolution of Property for Environmental Protection	103
H.	State Liability for Environmental Damage to Private Property	105
I.	Proprietor's Liability for Environmental Damage	106
J.	Permit Excuse in Environmental Liability	107
K.	Direct or Indirect Expropriation by EU Measures	108

CHAPTER 2 **Property and Environmental Protection in Czechia**

Ilona Jancarova, Jakub Hanak & Vojtech Vomacka

A.	Objects of Private Property	112
B.	Private Property in Natural Resources	115
C.	Private Property Used in Defense of Environmental Protection	118
D.	Natural Resources as Public Property or Interest	119
E.	Property in Public Aids for Beneficial Use of Natural Resources	120
F.	Expropriation	121
G.	Indirect Expropriation by Environmental Regulation?	122
H.	Dissolution of Property for Environmental Protection	124
I.	State Liability for Environmental Damage to Private Property	125

	J.	Proprietor's Liability for Environmental Damage	125
	K.	Permit Excuse in Environmental Liability	125
	L.	Direct or Indirect Expropriation by EU Measures	126
CHAPTER 3		Property and Environmental Protection in Croatia Lana Ofak	
	A.	Objects of Private Property	128
	B.	Private Property in Natural Resources	128
	C.	Private Property Used in Defense of Environmental Protection	129
	D.	Natural Resources as Public Property or Interest	130
	E.	Property in Public Aids for Beneficial Use of Natural Resources	132
	F.	Expropriation	132
	G.	Indirect Expropriation by Environmental Regulation?	133
	H.	Dissolution of Property for Environmental Protection	136
	I.	State Liability for Environmental Damage to Private Property	137
	J.	Proprietor's Liability for Environmental Damage	138
	K.	Permit Excuse in Environmental Liability	139
	L.	Direct or Indirect Expropriation by EU Measures	139
CHAPTER 4		Property and Environmental Protection in Denmark Peter Pagh	
	A.	Constitutional Aspects	142
	B.	The Scope of Private Property Protection	145
	C.	Natural Resources as Legal Concept	147
	D.	The Legal Status of Subsidies For Environmental Friendly Use	148
	E.	Landowner Liability, State Liability and Operator Liability	148
CHAPTER 5		Property and Environmental Protection in France Matthieu Galey	
	A.	Objects of Private Property	152
	B.	Private Property in Natural Resources	154
	C.	Private Property Used in Defense of Environmental Protection	156
	D.	Natural Resources as Public Property or Interest	159
	E.	Property in Public Aids for Beneficial Use of Natural Resources	161
	F.	Expropriation	162
	G.	Indirect Expropriation by Environmental Regulation?	163

H.	Dissolution of Property for Environmental Protection	165
I.	State Liability for Environmental Damage to Private Property (incl. Case of Communal Waste Disposal Site)	166
J.	Proprietor's Liability for Environmental Damage	167
K.	Permit Excuse in Environmental Liability	168
L.	Direct or Indirect Expropriation by EU Measures	169

CHAPTER 6 Property and Environmental Protection in Germany
Gerd Winter

A.	Objects of Private Property	172
B.	Private Property in Natural Resources	173
C.	Private Property Used in Defense of Environmental Protection (incl. Case of Polluting Factory)	173
D.	Natural Resources as Public Property or Interest	176
E.	Property in Public Aids for Beneficial Use of Natural Resources	177
F.	Expropriation	177
G.	Indirect Expropriation by Environmental Regulation?	179
H.	Dissolution of Property for Environmental Protection	181
I.	State Liability for Environmental Damage to Private Property (incl. Case of Municipal Waste Disposal Site)	182
J.	Proprietor's Liability for Environmental Damage	184
K.	Permit Excuse in Environmental Liability	184
L.	Direct or Indirect Expropriation by EU Measures	184

CHAPTER 7 Property and Environmental Protection in Hungary
Gyula Bándi

	Introduction: the Concept of Environmental and Property Rights	186
A.	Objects of Private Property	187
B.	Private Property in Natural Resources	188
C.	Private Property as Opponent and Defense of Environmental Protection	188
D.	Natural Resources as Public Property or Interest	190
E.	Property in Public Aids for Beneficial Use of Natural Resources	191
F.	Expropriation	192
G.	Indirect Expropriation by Environmental Regulation?	193
H.	Dissolution of Property for Environmental Protection	194
I.	State Liability for Environmental Damage to Private Property	194
J.	Proprietor's Liability for Environmental Damage	196
K.	Permit Excuse in Environmental Liability	196
L.	Direct or Indirect Expropriation by EU Measures	197

CHAPTER 8	Property and Environmental Protection in Italy Massimiliano Montini	
A.	Objects of Private Property	200
B.	Private Property in Natural Resources	201
C.	Private Property Used in Defense of Environmental Protection (incl. Case on Industrial Pollution)	202
D.	Natural Resources as Public Property or Interest	203
E.	Property in Public Aids for Beneficial Use of Natural Resources	203
F.	Expropriation	203
G.	Indirect Expropriation by Environmental Regulation?	204
H.	Dissolution of Property for Environmental Protection	205
I.	State Liability for Environmental Damage to Private Property (incl. Case of Municipal Waste Disposal Site)	205
J.	Proprietor's Liability for Environmental Damage	206
K.	Permit Excuse in Environmental Liability	207
L.	Direct or Indirect Expropriation by EU Measures	207
CHAPTER 9	Property and Environmental Protection in Latvia Zaneta Mikosa	
A.	Objects of Private Property	210
B.	Private Property in Natural Resources	212
C.	Private Property Used in Defense of Environmental Protection (incl. Case on Pollution from Industrial Installation)	213
D.	Natural Resources as Public Property or Interest	213
E.	Property in Public Aids for Beneficial Use of Natural Resources	214
F.	Expropriation	215
G.	Indirect Expropriation by Environmental Regulation?	216
H.	Dissolution of Property for Environmental Protection	218
I.	State Liability for Environmental Damage to Private Property	218
J.	Proprietor's Liability for Environmental Damage	219
K.	Permit Excuse in Environmental Liability	220
L.	Direct or Indirect Expropriation by EU Measures	221
CHAPTER 10	Property and Environmental Protection in the Netherlands Jan H. Jans & Annalies Outhuijse	
A.	Constitutional Framework	224
B.	Article 1, Protocol 1 ECHR	225
C.	The <i>Égalité</i> -Principle	228

D.	The Two Cases According to Dutch Law	231
E.	Summary	231
CHAPTER II	Property and Environmental Protection in Norway Ole Kristian Fauchald	
A.	Objects of Private Property	234
B.	Private Property in Natural Resources	235
C.	Private Property Used in Defense of Environmental Protection	235
D.	Natural Resources as Public Property or Interest	236
E.	Property in Public Aids for Beneficial Use of Natural Resources	238
F.	Expropriation	238
G.	Indirect Expropriation by Environmental Regulation?	239
H.	Dissolution of Property for Environmental Protection	240
I.	State Liability for Environmental Damage to Private Property	241
J.	Proprietor's Liability for Environmental Damage	242
K.	Permit Excuse in Environmental Liability	242
L.	Direct or Indirect Expropriation by EU Measures	243
CHAPTER 12	Property and Environmental Protection in Poland Barbara Iwanska & Mariusz Baran	
A.	Objects of Private Property; Property in Natural Resources	246
C.	Private Property in Natural Resources	249
D.	Natural Resources as Public Property or Interest	253
E.	Property in Public Aids for Beneficial Use of Natural Resources	255
F.	Expropriation	255
G.	Indirect Expropriation by Environmental Regulation?	256
H.	Dissolution of Property for Environmental Protection	258
J.	Proprietor's Liability for Environmental Damage	259
K.	Permit Excuse in Environmental Liability	259
L.	Direct or Indirect Expropriation by EU Measures	259
CHAPTER 13	Property and Environmental Protection in Portugal Alexandra Aragão	
A.	Introduction	262
B.	The Right to Property and to Environmental Protection in the Constitution	262
C.	Ownership of Natural Resources	263
D.	Management of Natural Resources	266

E.	Expropriation	269
F.	Restriction to Private Property	271
G.	Environmental Protection <i>Against</i> Private Property	275
H.	Environmental Protection <i>Through</i> Private Property	277
I.	Conclusion	277
CHAPTER 14	Property and Environmental Protection in Slovenia Rajko Knez	
A.	Objects of Private Property	280
B.	Private Property in Natural Resources	280
C.	Private Property Used in Defense of Environmental Protection	281
D.	Natural Resources as Public Property or Interest	283
E.	Property in Public Aids for Beneficial Use of Natural Resources	284
F.	Expropriation	284
G.	Indirect Expropriation by Environmental Regulation?	285
H.	Dissolution of Property for Environmental Protection	286
I.	State Liability for Environmental Damage to Private Property	287
J.	Proprietor's Liability for Environmental Damage	288
K.	Permit Excuse in Environmental Liability	288
L.	Direct or Indirect Expropriation by EU Measures	289
CHAPTER 15	Property and Environmental Protection in Spain Agustin Garcia-Ureta	
A.	Objects of Private Property	292
B.	Private Property in Natural Resources	293
C.	Private Property Used in Defense of Environmental Protection	294
D.	Natural Resources as Public Property or Interest	295
E.	Property in Public Aids for Beneficial Use of Natural Resources	296
F.	Expropriation	297
G.	Indirect Expropriation by Environmental Regulation?	298
H.	Dissolution of Property for Environmental Protection	300
I.	State Liability for Environmental Damage to Private Property	302
J.	Proprietor's Liability for Environmental Damage	303
K.	Permit Excuse in Environmental Liability	303
L.	Direct or Indirect Expropriation by EU Measures	304

CHAPTER 16	Property and Environmental Protection in the United Kingdom Eloise Scotford	
	Overall Comments	306
A.	Objects of Private Property	306
B.	Private Property in Natural Resources	307
C.	Private Property Used in Defence of Environmental Protection	308
D.	Private Property Used in Defence of Environmental Protection	310
E.	Property in Public Aids for Beneficial Use of Natural Resources	310
F.	Expropriation	311
G.	Indirect Expropriation by Environmental Regulation?	313
H.	Dissolution of Property for Environmental Protection Reasons	315
I.	State Liability for Environmental Damage by Government Action to Private Property	315
J.	Proprietor's Liability for Environmental Damage	316
K.	Permit Excuse in Environmental Liability	317
L.	Direct or Indirect Expropriation by EU Measures	317
IV	Part III Comparative Studies	
CHAPTER 1	In the Name of "Common Interest": Framing Environmental Goods as Common Goods Massimiliano Montini & Mery Ciacci	
A.	Introduction	322
B.	Public Ownership and Private Ownership of Environmental Goods in the European Jurisdictions: an Overview	324
C.	Ownership in Whose Interest?	327
D.	In the Name of 'Common Interest': Environmental Goods as Common Goods	331
E.	Conclusion	335
CHAPTER 2	Private Property in Request for Environmental Protection Rajko Knez	
A.	Introduction	340
B.	Property Based Remedies Asking for Environmental Protection	341
I.	Private Law Remedies	342

	2.	Public Law Remedies	345
	C.	Conclusion	347
CHAPTER 3		Private Rights and Public Regulation. Civil Liability and the 'Permit Defence'	
		Eloise Scotford	
	A.	No Permit Defence to Third Party Liability of Regulated Entities	350
	B.	Permit Defence to Third Party Liability of Regulated Entities	354
	C.	Conclusion	356
		<i>Questionnaire</i>	362